## Summary of Chicago Public Schools Supplemental Educational Services (SES) Provider Impacts

Results of a Multisite Study of the Implementation and Effects of Supplemental Educational Services, funded by the Institute for Educational Sciences, PR/Award number: R305A090301<sup>†</sup>

The information on SES provider impacts in Chicago Public Schools that we report in the table below is based on econometric analyses that use gains in reading and math test scores as the outcome measures. We employ four alternative approaches to estimating provider effects—value-added models, student fixed effects models, school and student fixed effects models, and propensity score matching models— that adjust for student and school characteristics that may differ across providers. In the table, we report whether a given SES provider had a statistically significant positive impact on students' reading and/or math achievement in the 2008-09, 2009-10 and/or 2010-11 school years. We report that a SES provider had a "high impact" if it had an impact larger than the average impact on student learning for all providers (as estimated by the value-added with school fixed effects models). If no impacts are noted, this implies the results were inconclusive, that is, the range of student test-score improvements spanned both positive and negative numbers or improvements were zero or negative.

Importantly, we did not estimate impacts individually for SES providers that served fewer than 30 students in a given year, as there are statistical limitations to producing accurate estimates for small numbers of students. Thus, we estimated overall "small provider" impacts for all of the small providers together; these results and the providers included in this analysis are shown at the end of the table.

For all of the providers, we also report the average number of hours of SES received by students attending their programs (in the 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11 school years). **The analysis found a strong**, *positive* relationship between the number of hours of SES students attended and their test score gains.

## In the table below:

- Providers with statistically significant positive impacts on student achievement (as measured by improvements in test scores) are highlighted in gray.
- Statistically significant student test-score improvements that are above the average impact are identified in the third column.

<sup>†</sup>Study website: <u>http://sesiq2.wceruw.org/papers.html</u>; contributors to this analysis include Carolyn Heinrich, Hiren Nisar, Martina Chura, Huiping Cheng, Marcus Dillender, Hyun Sik Kim, Nate Inglis-Steinfeld and Curtis Jones.

## Chicago Public Schools Supplemental Educational Services (SES) Provider Impacts on Student Achievement, Hours of SES Provided, and Hourly Rates: 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11 School Years

Provider name		Positive impacts on student achievement	High impact (greater than average)	Average hours of SES received by students		
		acmevement	average)	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
A+ Tutoring Service, LT	D	reading (2008-09)	reading (2008-09)	46.1	32.6	43.1
Academic Advantage	(ONSITE)	reading (2010-11)	reading (2010-11)			42.7
African American Imag	es	math (2010-11)	math (2010-11)			50
Ahead of Class Services						24.2
A.I.M. High		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11)	reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11)	51.0	45.8	53.6
		math (2010-11)	math (2010-11)			
ASPIRA				31.8	19.6	
All Children Can Learn	(ONSITE)					36.8
	(ONSITE)	math (2008-09)	math (2008-09)	39.5	47.1	
Babbage Net School	(OFFSITE & ONLINE)				25.4	17.6
	(ONSITE & ONLINE)					30.6
	(ONSITE)			38.5	24.4	
Black Star Project	(OFFSITE)				46.0	
						34.5
Brain Hurricane		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11)	reading (2008-09) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11)	32.4	35.1	36.6
Brainfuse	One-to-One Online	reading (2010-11)	reading (2010-11)	22.7 24.4	27.5 24.8	22.0
Breakthrough Urban Ministries						40.5
Brilliance Academy				24.7	31.3	41.2
Cambridge Educational Services		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2010-11)	reading (2008-09) math (2008-09) math (2010-11)	27.0	24.4	31.2
Carter, Reddy & Associ	ates, Inc.					35.5

Provider name		Positive impacts on student achievement	High impact (greater than average)	Average hours of SES received by students		
				2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
Center of Higher Development Chess Academy		math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11)	math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11)	<mark>48.4</mark>	<mark>43.5</mark>	43.3 47.8
Chicago Ace it Tutoring	(ONSITE)					24.4
Children's Home + Aid	Society, Inc.	math (2008-09) math (2009-10)	math (2008-09) math (2009-10)	36.8	31.7	37.7
ClubZ! Tutoring Service	e, Inc.	math (2010-11)	math (2010-11)	32.9	33.6	50.8
College Nannies + Tuto	oring					30.2
Comp Ed II, Inc.						52.5
Growing Scholars Educ	cational Center					47.1
CSC Julex Learning				50.3		
Educate Online (forme	erly Catapult)	reading (2009-10)	reading (2009-10)	18.6	23.1	
Educational Specialties (ONSITE)					47.9	
Foilure Free Deeding	(OFFSITE)			27.0		
Failure Free Reading	(ONSITE)			31.9		
	Lincoln Park	reading (2008-09) reading (2010-11)	reading (2008-09) reading (2010-11)	34.5	40.0	
Huntington	ONSITE			30.7	32.4	33.6
	Oak Lawn			29.8		
IEP (ONSITE)			reading (2008-09)	46.3	46.4	44.9
Imagine Learning	(ONSITE & ONLINE)					28.0
Learn it System		reading (2010-11)	reading (2010-11)			44.3
Literacy for All			math (2009-10)	42.9	46.1	47.7
Mainstream Development Educational Group				36.6	21.7	30
NESI (combined with small providers in 2009-10)		math (2008-09) math (2010-11)	(math 2010-11)	47.9	45.1	48.6
Newton Learning		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11)	reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2010-11)	45.0	38.9	44.8
One-to-One Learning Center		reading (2008-09) math (2008-09)	reading (2008-09) math (2008-09)	54.6		

Provider name		Positive impacts on student achievement	High impact (greater than average)	Average hours of SES received by students		
		achievenient	average)	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
Orion's Mind		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09)	math (2008-09) reading (2010-11)	33.6	38.5	42.2 39.2
	(OFFSITE)	math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11)	math (2010-11)			
Platform Learning				28.5		
Poder Ser (ONSITE)		reading (2008-09)	reading (2008-09)	36.0	39.0	49.2
Princeton Review		reading (2008-09) math (2008-09)	math (2008-09)	42.9		
Progressive Learning		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2009-10)	reading (2008-09)	29.2	29.3	30.7
Rocket Learning	(OFFSITE)	reading (2009-10)			32.4	
Partners, LLC	(ONSITE)	reading (2005-10)		30.3	29.6	30.7
SES of Illinois		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11) math (2010-11)	reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2009-10)	34.4	30.5	35.0
SPC Educational Solution	IS					50.3
Scholars of the 21 <sup>st</sup> Cent	ury					58.2
School Service Systems		reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2009-10) reading (2010-11)	reading (2008-09) reading (2009-10) math (2009-10)	57.4	54.7	57.9
Smart Kids, Inc.	(ONSITE/ONLINE)					52
Spanish Learning Center	, Inc.	reading (2010-11) math (2010-11)	reading (2010-11) math (2010-11)			53.5
Tutorial Services				36.4	51.3	
Sylvan Learning/Ace it Tutoring	(ONSITE/ONLINE)	reading (2010-11)	reading (2010-11)			32.1
Sylvan Learning						
The Homework Master Center/Train Up a Child	(ONSITE)	reading (2010-11)	reading (2010-11)			35.0
Unparalleled Solutions		reading (2009-10) math (2008-09) math (2010-11)	(math 2010-11)		44.8	59.2

Provider name		Positive impacts on student achievement	High impact (greater than average)	Average hours of SES rece by students 2008-09 2009-10 2010		
Small Providers		reading (2009-10)	reading (2009-10)			
(combined assessmen	•	1000 III (2005 IO)	Teading (2005-10)		1	
A+ Education Centers	(OFFSITE)		<b>6</b>	47.8	52.3	
ATS Project Success		Individual provider effects not estimated		27.6	27.2	
Acadomic Advantago	(OFFSITE)	for small providers serving fewer than 30 students; see combined effects above		18.2		
Academic Advantage	(ONSITE)			7.0	42.7	
Academic Solutions, In	nc. (OFFSITE)				13.0	
African American Ima	ges Talent Center			34.0		50
Ahead of the Class Ser Spectra)	rvices (formerly				18.6	24.25
All Children Can	(OFFSITE)				48.6	
Learn	(ONSITE)	-				36.8
Association House of	Chicago				46.2	
Black Star Project		-				34.5
-	BSG Training & Consulting, Inc.		-			
Breakthrough Urban I	-			63.1	60.9	40.5
C&T After School Programs (ONSITE)		-		18.0		
Carter, Reddy & Assoc	ciates, Inc.	Individual provider effects not estimated		25.5	14.7	35.5
Center of Higher Deve	elopment (OFFSITE)			21.0		43.3
Chicago Ace it Tutorin	g					24.4
College Nannies + Tut	ors					30.2
Comp Ed II	-		for small providers serving fewer than			52.5
Growing Scholars Edu	cational Center	30 students; see combined effects above				47.1
Grade Results					11.9	
Hope Haven Christian	Academy			44.1		
KnowledgePoints	(ONSITE)	1		33.5	38.3	
Learning Center	(OFFSITE)	]		51.1	52.5	
	Mainstream Development Educational		1			30
Group						
Poder Ser						49.2
Reach for Tomorrow				23.8	25.2	50.0
Scholars for the 21 <sup>st</sup> Century				50.0	<b></b>	58.2
Smart Kids, Inc.	(OFFSITE)	4		53.9	54.9	52
Spanish Learning Center, Inc. (ONSITE/ONLINE)				52.2	52.8	52
Train Up A Child				40.8	42.4	
The Homework Maste	(ONSITE)					

Provider name	Positive impacts on student achievement	High impact (greater than average)	Average hours of SES received by students		
Center/Train Up a Child					35.0
iLEARNED Online				10.3	